

AGENDA MATERIAL

DATE 9-6-22 ITEM NO. RA 3S

Amy Santos

From: David Smutzer <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Friday, September 16, 2022 3:47 PM
To: District1; DIST2; District3; District5; District4; COB_mail
Cc: Carla Blackwell; Kathryn Skinner
Subject: P22RZ00001, TUCSON SCHOOL DISTRICT NO. 1 - S. CARDINAL AVENUE REZONING Tucson School District No. 1
Attachments: Proposed TUSD Rezoning-S. Westover.pdf

CAUTION: This message and sender come from outside Pima County. If you did not expect this message, proceed with caution. Verify the sender's identity before performing any action, such as clicking on a link or opening an attachment.

Honorable Chair and Members, Pima County Board of Supervisors:

Attached please find my letter detailing concerns as well as proposed additional special conditions for your consideration regarding the proposed rezoning: P22RZ00001, TUCSON SCHOOL DISTRICT NO. 1 - S. CARDINAL AVENUE REZONING Tucson School District No. 1, represented by Paradigm Land Design, L.L.C.. The proposed rezoning has been continued until the Board Meeting of October 18, 2022. There are numerous errors and discrepancies in the consultants reports and when combined with first hand knowledge of the changing transportation traffic patterns affecting our neighborhoods over the past 20 plus years, support limiting the proposed development access points only to Cardinal Avenue and delaying construction until the widening of Valencia Road.

Thank you in advance for consideration of my concerns and proposed additional rezoning special conditions.

Dave Smutzer

SEP 16 22 PM 04:05 PC CLK OF RD

September 16, 2022

Pima County Board of Supervisors
Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

RE: P22RZ00001, TUCSON SCHOOL DISTRICT NO. 1 - S. CARDINAL AVENUE
REZONING Tucson School District No. 1, represented by Paradigm Land Design, L.L.C.
Continued until meeting of 10/18/2022

I am writing to submit my concerns and recommendations for modifications to the standard and special conditions to be attached to the above referenced rezoning still under consideration by the Pima County Board of Supervisors. My concerns regarding the proposed development will focus primarily on transportation impacts to my neighborhood El Sol Acres and those of the various Salido Del Sol subdivisions. South Westover Avenue is the primary residential street through all of these subdivisions between Valencia Road and Los Reales Road and will be significantly impacted should the proposed two ingress/egress points on South Westover Avenue be approved as proposed in the preliminary development plan.

Background:

My family and I have lived on South Westover Avenue for the past 22 years and my in-laws have also lived on S. Westover Avenue for over 40 years. There have been a series of changes primarily to South Mission Road and South Cardinal Avenue that have negatively impacted and increased the amount of traffic using South Westover Avenue.

1. Mission Road:

- a) There have been two significant changes on South Mission Road. The first has been the lowering of the speed limit by Pima County DOT from 45 MPH to 35 MPH.
- b) The second is the intersection of South Mission Road and Los Reales Road has been modified by Pima Count DOT to a three way stop.

Impact: As a result of the reduction of speed there has been increased speed enforcement by Tohono O'odam Police Department which has resulted in encouraging drivers to cut through between Valencia Road and Los Reales Road via S. Westover Avenue. The same can be said for the creation of the three way stop at S. Mission Road and Los Reales Road. Again, drivers are encouraged to cut through on S. Westover Avenue to avoid the long back up at the three way stop as there are no stop signs or speed control devices on S. Westover Avenue between Los Reales Road and Valencia Road.

2. Cardinal Avenue:

- a) The tragic death of Ebonee Marie Moody promoted Pima County to implement some improvement to S. Cardinal Avenue including street lighting along with the renaming of Cardinal Park to Ebonee Marie Moody Park. The portion of S. Cardinal Avenue adjacent to the park also has an advisory speed of 25 mph. Subsequently, the Pima

County Sheriff appropriately increased patrols and speed enforcement of S. Cardinal Avenue ensuring drivers stay within the legal speed limit in the vicinity of the park.

Impact: As a result, drivers find it easier and faster to utilize S. Westover Avenue from the numerous subdivisions south of Los Reales Road and West of Cardinal Avenue to access Valencia Road.

3. S. Westover Avenue:

a) The opening of the Neighborhood Walmart approximately 10 years ago at the north end of S. Westover Avenue has resulted in dramatic increases in traffic volumes on S. Westover Avenue with the installation of an ingress/egress from S. Westover Avenue to the Neighborhood Walmart. A review of Exhibit II-A-1 from the Paradigm Land Design Site Analysis report provides an overview of the numerous subdivisions from the east, south and west that now utilize S. Westover Avenue to gain direct access to the Neighborhood Walmart.

IMPACT: Not only has the volume or ADT dramatically increased on South Westover Avenue, but there is a total disregard for the speed limit of 25 MPH. Cars will pass those drivers going the speed limit and even recently a car passed a moving school bus in front of my house. As a result, instead of expecting drivers to be driving around 25-30 MPH it is now more common and expected that drivers will easily be driving 35 MPH.

Basically, drivers can go the same speed limit on S. Westover Avenue as they can on S. Cardinal Avenue, Camino de la Tierra and S. Mission Road.

b) The ADT volume provided in Paradigm Land Design Site analysis on page 25 appears to be in conflict with data from the Pima County Department of Transportation ADT report. *According to Pima County DOT records of April 2020, that includes a traffic count on April 17 for S. Westover Avenue south of Valencia Road, reflects an ADT of 4252. This count appears to be almost twice as high as the ADT volume provided in the Paradigm Land Design Site Analysis report of only 2426.*

c) Page 25 of the same report provides a Daily Capacity (VPD) for S. Westover Avenue of 10,656, the exact same number that is used for Camino de la Tierra, (a divided highway with raised median and left turn bays, wide travel lanes and sidewalks) with a posted speed limit of 35 MPH and S. Cardinal Avenue identified as a *major roadway* with a posted speed of 35 MPH and right of way of 150 feet. *South Westover Avenue is an early 1980's subdivision design standards and cannot be compared or classified the same as Camino de la Tierra or S. Cardinal Avenue.*

d) Page 25 also lists S. Westover Avenue as a Key Connecting Street with only 50 foot right of way while Camino de La Tierra with 90 foot right of way and higher ADT is considered a residential street. Camino de la Tierra is more of a key connect street than S. Westover Avenue which truly is a residential street that includes street parking thereby restricting the travel lanes and right of way available for pedestrians, bicycles, and cars already making S. Westover Avenue congested and dangerous combination.

- e). Page 25 of the report lists a 25 MPH speed limit for Camino de la Tierra from Valencia Road to Los Reales Road when in fact the actual posted speed limit is 35 MPH.
4. S. Westover Avenue has no left turn bays, no sidewalks, allows for street parking on the west side and is not designed for large traffic volumes and cannot be compared to S. Cardinal Avenue and S. Camino de La Tierra. *As a result, it is common for pedestrians and bicycles to simultaneously be using the limited available pavement width to accommodate these various modes of transportation.*
 5. As a result of the increased ADT and VPD on S. Westover Avenue, it is common for up to 7-8 cars in que to make a right turn onto the congested two-lane Valencia Road.
 6. **According to M. Esparza Engineering Report on Page 22, 55% of the trip distribution is anticipated to utilize S. Westover Avenue and only 45% to S. Cardinal Avenue.** S. Cardinal Avenue a four-lane divided highway signal-controlled intersection with Valencia Road while S. Westover Avenue is not a signalized interchange with Valencia Road. *Why would a majority of the trip distributions be onto a narrow subdivision street as opposed to the S. Cardinal Avenue which is a major roadway with 150 feet of right of way available for continued expansion of the four-lane divided highway to accommodate the increased traffic?*
 7. Page 26 of the M. Esparaza Engineering Report states: ***The poor LOS on the northbound and southbound approaches at the Valencia Road/Westover Avenue intersection is experienced under existing conditions.*** Again, increasing the ADT and VPD on S. Westover Avenue should not be permitted and would further exacerbate an already congested non signalized intersection.
 8. Pima County Staff Report Page 6 under Transportation states: “The TIS also identifies that some of the northbound and southbound intersection turning movements of the Valencia Road and Westover Avenue intersection are currently functioning below an adequate level of service (LOS). The LOS is a qualitative description of how well a roadway or intersection operates under prevailing traffic conditions. The aforementioned turning movements operate at LOS F, but the acceptable Pima County intersection turning movements is LOS E. Based on the analysis, the project will increase turning movement delays more than 10%. The Subdivision and Development Street Standards (SDSS) indicates that if the performance of the existing intersection is already below the LOS E threshold and if the delay is increased by 10% more than the existing, mitigation measures must be taken to decrease the delay back to the 10% or less threshold.” *While a future signal light could be considered, due to the intersection’s close proximity to the signalized intersection of Cardinal Avenue seems unlikely and also appears that the cost of the future signalization would be borne by the county. Rather than further exacerbate the current poor level of service at the Westover Avenue intersection and to avoid further financial liability by the county, there should not be any additional traffic associated with the proposed development permitted access onto S. Westover Avenue. Improvements to S. Cardinal Avenue would seem to be the more logical and financially better investment for the county to be borne by the developer.*

9. Page 26 of the Site Analysis report discusses only one access point from the subdivision to S. Westover Avenue. However, on Page 52 states: *The project access on Westover Avenue is about 1,200 feet south of Valencia Road and aligns with Vereda Azul. A secondary access point on Westover Avenue will be constructed approximately 325 feet south of this first entry.*
10. The Neighborhood Walmart Plaza also includes a pad on the S.W Corner of Westover Avenue and Valencia that has been rezoned for a drive thru retail pad. Once constructed this will also increase the usage of the Westover/Valencia intersection and not sure if the buildout of the pads has been factored into the traffic analysis. *As noted in the above-mentioned staff report the intersection is already functioning below an adequate level of service.*
11. W. Valencia Road
 - a) The dramatic increase in the number and size of subdivision developments west on Valencia Road such as Star Pass and increased developments in the area of Casino Del Sol has also dramatically increased the traffic volumes on West Valencia Road. *It is not uncommon for east bound traffic to be backed up from S. Mission Road to S. Westover Avenue and all the way to Cardinal Avenue during morning rush hour since Valencia Road is only two lanes in each direction.* A review on the increased number of traffic accidents between S. Mission Road and S. Westover Avenue would testify to the need for W. Valencia Road to be widened to three lanes each direction from Mission Road to Camino de la Tierra.
 - b) It is also common for the left turn bay from Valencia Road onto S. Westover Avenue to be at full capacity with cars in que to make the turn onto S. Westover Avenue.
12. Pima County Development Services Staff Report
 - a). Attached is page 8 of the staff report discussing the Traffic Impact to Valencia and Mission Intersection and raises serious concerns regarding the current alarming backups on Valencia Road and accident history at the intersection with Mission Road.
 - b). On page 5 of the staff report states: *east of the project site, the traffic count is 36,493 ADT. Valencia Road has an approximate traffic capacity of 35,820 ADT. Clearly Valencia Road has already exceeded the design capacity.*
 - b) Page 5 of staff report under Transportation states: “Cardinal Avenue is classified as an Urban Major Collector by its Federal Functional Classification. Adjacent to the site, the traffic count is 7,507 ADT with an approximate capacity of 10,360 ADT. Cardinal Avenue is a bus route with 30-minute service to the Laos Transit Center and central Tucson...”. *Since Cardinal Avenue is an Urban Major Collector, under capacity with 150 feet of right of way and is a signalized intersection with Valencia Road, makes this the most logical choice for all access points to the subdivision to be from Cardinal Avenue and no access points from S. Westover Avenue.*

The discrepancies pointed out in the two consultant reports as well as the concerns raised by staff support a position of eliminating any access points to the subdivision from S. Westover Avenue and requiring all access points to utilize Cardinal Avenue. Furthermore, additional review of the proposed transportation impacts to Valencia Road and the intersection with Mission Road is warranted due to Valencia Road already at overcapacity and the number of accidents at the intersection with Mission Road. Additional offsite improvements to S. Cardinal Avenue are justified to accommodate all traffic impacts from the development and the timing of the development should only occur after the widening of Valencia Road.

I am recommending the following additional special conditions that should be attached to the rezoning:

Recommended Additional Rezoning Special Conditions:

1. No ingress/egress access points to any segment of S. Westover Avenue. All access points to S. Cardinal Avenue only which is the major roadway to be widened to accommodate the increase subdivision related traffic.
2. No development to occur until the widening of Valencia Road to three lanes in each direction between S. Mission Road and Camino de la Tierra or Cardinal Avenue.

Perhaps this rezoning request does not warrant a posting of an upcoming rezoning as there were no signs posted in sight anywhere along Cardinal or Westover Avenues. I am not sure how many individuals in all of the Salido Del Sol subdivisions and El Rio Acres are aware of this rezoning and the projected impacts to S. Westover Avenue and Valencia Road.

Please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

Dave Smutzer

Dave Smutzer

Attachment

C: Carla Blackwell, Director Pima County Development Services
Kathryn Skinner, P.E, Director Pima County Department of Transportation

ATTACHMENT

Staff Report Page 8:

Traffic Impact to Valencia & Mission Intersection

The biggest concern we have and has yet to be spoken to, is the major traffic impact this development will have on the Valencia & Mission Road intersection. This intersection is documented by Pima Association of Governments to be one of the most vulnerable intersections within the city. At peak hours, the traffic has an alarming back-up span; in addition, our TOPD data reflects immense number of accidents at this site. The traffic study provided by Paradigm is focused on the intersection of Valencia at Cardinal, and also Westover. Westover Intersection is not a true intersection, however. There are no lights, and vehicles infrequently make attempts to cross 4 lanes of traffic as it is challenging to do so during peak hours. Additionally, if one looks at aerial imagery of this location, the pattern of dirt debris on road reflects traffic making consistent right-hand turns from Westover to Valencia, and not going straight as opposed to the dirt debris pattern seen at the Cardinal and Mission intersection which clearly illustrates complete intersection movement. The two major intersections that would be impacted by this proposed 61-acre development would be Valencia & Cardinal and Valencia & Mission, and we urge Pima County Planning & Zoning Commission/Pima County Board of Supervisors to analyze and take into account the impact this would have at Valencia & Mission (which is the intersection that lies within San Xavier District boundaries) when considering this rezoning case. This very fragile intersection is at the point of max capacity until certain improvements have been made. We believe there would be an immediate and adverse difference in traffic flow that would affect Pima County and San Xavier District residence alike if improvements are not made to this intersection before allowing this magnitude of development. This change in the overall quality of life to residence in the area would create complaints not only in Pima County, but also within the San Xavier District. It is because of this, we would like to reiterate the need for Pima County to take all of this into consideration during the rezoning discussions.