



# MEMORANDUM

Date: April 12, 2024

To: The Honorable Chair and Members  
Pima County Board of Supervisors

From: Jan Leshner   
County Administrator

Re: **Additional Information for the April 16, 2024 Board of Supervisors Meeting – Addendum Item 10, Duplication of Pima County Programs and/or Services**

## Background

On March 19, 2024, Supervisor Lee placed an item on the April 2, 2024, Board of Supervisors Agenda requesting that the County Administrator provide a list and explanation of County funded community programs and services that may represent a duplication of County department programs and services. On April 1, 2024, I provided a memorandum to the Board that included examples of contracts with external vendors for programs and services in the areas of Behavioral Health, Community & Workforce Development, the Health Department and Pima Animal Care Center. At the April 2, 2024, Board of Supervisors Meeting, the Board discussed this topic and provided clarification on the areas of interest and the type of information desired. Specifically, the Board indicated wanting information related to the following:

- Comparison of functions performed by the Pima County Attractions & Tourism Department and Visit Tucson;
- Comparison of functions performed by the Pima County Economic Development Department and Sun Corridor Inc., and an explanation of why Pima County has historically provided more funding than other jurisdictions;
- Comparison of functions performed by the Pima County Community & Workforce Development and JobPath, and what may be done to increase partnership and collaboration between the two entities;
- Information on the non-competitive funding approach for the Metropolitan Education Commission (MEC).

As part of the overall discussion, Board members placed an emphasis on how the functions performed in-house by County departments are similar or different from external services provided by other agencies, and whether similar functions could be kept in-house to strengthen the services and programs delivered by the County. Additional clarification was provided by Board members to focus on this kind of duplication, not Outside Agency organizations providing services to specific areas of town or communities. It was also noted that in some cases, similar functions internally may be spread across departments reporting to different Deputy County Administrators.

APR 12 24 PM 04:00 PC CLK OF BD 

### Comparison of Services

The following is a comparison of services related to the areas specifically noted during the April 2, 2024, Board of Supervisors discussion:

#### *Pima County Attractions and Tourism / Visit Tucson*

The primary focus of the Pima County Attractions and Tourism (AT) Department is to bolster the economic impact of tourism throughout the County. Efforts are focused in the following core areas:

1. Pima County Attractions – AT manages the leases for 10 county-owned attraction properties. In doing so, AT has a relationship with each operator and provides business development, marketing, training, and revenue enhancement programs for the attractions. The goal is to increase awareness and attendance to these attractions among visitors and locals, driving tax revenue to the County.
  - Ajo Community Golf Course
  - Arizona-Sonora Desert Museum
  - Colossal Cave Mountain Park
  - Musselman Honda Circuit
  - Old Tucson
  - Pima Air and Space Museum
  - Pima County Fairgrounds
  - Titan Missile Museum
  - Tucson Dragway
  - Tucson Speedway

In addition, the department also promotes the attractions in the greater southern Arizona region to help lengthen the visitors stay in the region and increase the visitor spend for the good of local businesses.

2. Southern Arizona Heritage & Visitor Center (SAHVC)—AT oversees the day-to-day operation of the Visitor Center located in the Pima County Historic Courthouse. Open seven days a week, the SAHVC was designed to be the starting point for the visitor, to inspire his or her activities, and increase length of stay and return visits. Similarly, locals have learned something new about their hometown in the SAHVC. Complete with interactive displays, a concierge team supported by enthusiastic volunteers, a theatre showcasing local points of interest and events, historical exhibits on loan from partner museums, and a profitable gift shop offering unique souvenirs from local attractions and artisans, the Visitor Center has continued to grow in both visitor traffic and popularity since opening three years ago. AT also manages the common visitor

spaces throughout the courthouse including the conference rooms, Law & Order display, Dillinger Courtroom, and Courtyard. This includes oversight of the leases for 520 Coffee, Visit Tucson and the University of Arizona Gem & Mineral Museum who are tenants in the building. The team has also developed and established weekly courtyard activations during high season (September – May) that are provided free to the public. These include courtyard lawn games, children’s programming with Children’s Museum Tucson, and live music – all during the lunch hours for maximum day-time exposure. In the last couple of years, the department has developed a successful and profitable rental program for the use of these spaces by the public for private and community events and is largely booked during high season.

3. Local Events – The department offers marketing support to local festivals, sporting events, and conferences held throughout Pima County. Attractions and Tourism partners with many other outside organizations to market special events, target destination travel groups, and support community organizations focused on tourism and increased residential use of our parks and open spaces. Examples include Pueblos Del Maiz, Mariachi Festival, Loop the Loop, Tucson Meet Yourself, El Tour de Tucson, Downtown Parade of Lights. The department also directly pursues the attracting of festivals, sporting events and conferences throughout the County.
4. Outside Agencies – AT also administers contracts and supports 22 outside agencies who operate in the tourism sector, as attractions, support organizations, or special event producers. The support of these organizations fosters growth in the industry and has led to additional partnerships for the good of the region.
5. Film Permits – The department also fields all requests for film and photo permits in the county. Film companies requesting the use of Pima County rights-of-way or land on which to film must complete an application for a Special Use Permit and provide a Certificate of Insurance listing Pima County as additionally insured. These all come through Attractions & Tourism to coordinate County approvals and issue the permit. The exposure generated from film on TV, online, and other visual and digital media has a huge impact on the local economy, tourism and visitor spending.

The functions of the Pima County Attractions & Tourism Department are different that Visit Tucson, in that Visit Tucson is Pima County’s statutorily designated Destination Marketing Organization (DMO), which promotes Southern Arizona as a travel destination. DMO’s are known as tourism boards or Convention & Visitors Bureaus and in Visit Tucson’s case, include a membership dues paying base including restaurants, hotels, and convention centers. Visit Tucson directly represents their membership and receives a percentage of hotel/motel bed taxes to help fund their duties. Visit Tucson includes a sales department that travels internationally representing Pima County and Southern Arizona, as well as a public relations and communications team that works with international and national press to bring stories in print, radio and digital media to our area. These efforts are supplemental to the functions performed by Pima County Attractions & Tourism.

*Pima County Economic Development / Sun Corridor Inc.*

The Pima County Economic Development (PCECD) Department implements the economic development priorities and policies of the Pima County Board of Supervisors under the direction of the Pima County Administrator. Efforts are focused in the following core areas:

1. PCECD focuses on regional economic growth with a core responsibility being enhancing the economic prosperity of the residents of Pima County. PCECD advances initiatives to fulfill the policies contained in the Board-approved Pima County Economic Development Strategy through collaboration with Pima County departments and in partnership with regional jurisdictions and stakeholders.
2. Works on direct sourcing of economic development opportunities through lead generation software, partnerships with regional municipalities, and attendance at various training and conference events. Pursues business attraction, retention, and expansion of companies and supports small business, start-ups, workforce development and interacts directly with Pima County small business owners and citizens.
3. Administers Pima County economic development contracts such as the Ajo Chamber of Commerce, JobPath, Metropolitan Education Commission and the DM-50 supporting Davis Monthan Air Force Base.
4. Coordinates planning of County economic development-related infrastructure for County-owned land and buildings available for economic development and works closely with the Pima County Community Development & Workforce Department and external education institutions and training entities to meet employer workforce needs.
5. PCECD serves as staff to the Pima County Small Business Commission and the Arizona Border Counties Coalition.
6. Works with Pima County lobbyist on matters concerning economic development and related to the Board-approved Legislative Agenda.

For the most part, these functions are different and complimentary to the role Sun Corridor Inc. (SCI) performs. As an independent entity reporting to its own Board of Directors and private sector members, SCI primarily focuses on regional economic competitiveness and quality of life through promoting business investment and primary job creation. SCI receives a combination of private and government funding contributions. For Fiscal Year 2023-2024, SCI received \$650,000 from Pima County to perform services related to deliverables contained in their contract approved by the Pima County Board of Supervisors and administered by the County Administrator and PCECD. Pima County has historically provided funding to SCI in larger amounts than other regional jurisdictions, based on the philosophy that Pima County represented the larger region and that widely promoting economic growth and prosperity to benefit all residents regardless of jurisdictional boundary is a fundamentally important role of Pima County government. The below summary shows jurisdictional funding amounts from FY 2017-18 to 2022-23.

**Jurisdictional Funding FY 2017-2018 to 2022-2023**

Fiscal Year	2017-2018	2018-2019	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023
Pima County	\$650,000	\$650,000	\$650,000	\$617,500	\$650,000	\$650,000
COT	\$0	\$10,000	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$50,000
Marana	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000
Oro Valley	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000
Sahuarita	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$10,000
South Tucson	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0

As noted, the funding from Pima County supports the delivery services complementary to those performed by PCECD and consistent with the Pima County Economic Development Strategic Plan. SCI’s contract deliverables include supporting Pima County’s and the region’s economic development activities, including business attraction, high-wage job facilitation, marketing and promoting the region nationally and internationally, collaborating on marketing Pima County-owned properties, partnering with Pima County and other entities on talent development and attraction, hosting site selector visits and forums, assessing and enhancing regional competitiveness, administering the Foreign Trade Zone process, and providing economic impact analyses.

While PCECD and SCI collaborate on business attraction, retention and expansion requests, site selector and real estate broker engagements, marketing of Pima County economic development sites and responding to requests by companies looking to locate or expand in Pima County, these efforts are largely additive not duplicative.

*Pima County One-Stop / JobPath*

Community & Workforce Development operates Pima County One-Stop which offers comprehensive job training services to eligible residents of Pima County. The One-Stop provides three levels of support for clients seeking employment-related service.

1. Basic services that include staff assisted support for resume, job search, and utilization of facilities (i.e. space for job interviews, computers, phone, copier/printer, workshops, etc.)
2. Career Services in which eligible clients actively engage with professional staff for career counseling, job search, staff assisted services and support.
3. Training Services in which eligible clients enter training programs with grant fund assistance.

Service eligibility is based on federal Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) criteria. The three categories of eligibility for WIOA programs differ by program participant class but are summarized below:

1. Dislocated Workers, defined as those losing a job by no fault of their own; displaced homemakers or spouses who have limited work history due to dependency on spousal income; and recently discharged veterans.
2. Adult, job seekers who are over the age of 24, and low income based on 70% Lower Living Standards Income Level guidelines, or long term unemployed (more than 27 weeks).
3. Youth, participants between the ages of 16 to 24 who are low income, have barriers to employment or secondary education completion.

One-Stop services are generally organized to avoid duplication by bringing relevant service providers within a network and distributing funding according to service-provider specialty, client need and availability of resources. In general, however, clients participate in monthly meetings with case managers and a one-year follow up meeting after program completion. Peer support includes workshops covering such topics as employability skills, leadership development, self-employment/entrepreneurial, financial, and computer literacy. Job leads and other staff-assisted services are available and offered at all 13 job center locations (4 County and 9 community partner sites). One-Stop partners with more than 100 training providers including Pima Community College (PCC), and offers over 200 industry specific programs, leading to industry recognized credentials and state licensing. Annually, more than 2,200 customers are enrolled in formal structured training programs. Comparison of the differences in programmatic elements between One-Stop and JobPath are summarized in the table below.

In the last program year, Pima County One-Stop served 19,308 individual clients, 97 were co-enrolled with Job Path. Current credential attainment rate by One-Stop clients is 71 percent as verified by case managers, training providers and the State database. The average client wage at job placement is \$21.00 per hour based on employer validated data.

JobPath operates under two contracts administered by Pima County. The General Fund direct select contract is administered by Pima County Economic Development Department, and the federal ARPA/CSLFRF sub-recipient contract is administered by Pima County Grants Management and Innovation. Both contracts share the same contract deliverables but have differing reporting requirements. Under its current General Fund contract, JobPath provides career counseling and case management services to 670 eligible adults in Pima County in targeted industries. Assistance is individualized and may include tuition, books, fees, transportation, childcare and emergencies. Clients meet bi-monthly in peer-support sessions with a career counselor and receive job placement assistance before program completion. Target wage placement is at a minimum of \$16 per hour and clients are tracked for 2 years after job placement.

The current contract requires that 40 to 45 percent of JobPath trainees obtain a certificate credential, successfully complete an apprenticeship, or complete at least one year of a two-year degree program. Additionally, 80 percent of its clients completing the program year must gain employment or for clients complete the second year of a two-year degree program. All certificate and degree programs are conducted by Pima Community College. Additionally, 68 percent of JobPath clients are classified as extremely low income, however, it is unclear based on the information available how many may meet One-Stop WIOA eligibility criteria.

The JobPath 2023 annual report to the County identifies average client salaries of \$50,000 per year and a 90 percent graduation rate. These assertions are plausible and consistent with prior reports but are not independently validated.

Programmatic Comparison

<i>Program Element</i>	<i>One Stop</i>	<i>JobPath</i>
<b><i>Tuition Payment Assistance</i></b>	\$3,500 per individual	\$2,000 per individual
<b><i>Paid On-The-Job Training/Apprenticeship Program</i></b>	50% of wages covered by program	Unknown
<b><i>Career Coaching/Career Preparation</i></b>	Yes	Yes
<b><i>Childcare Scholarship</i></b>	Yes, through PEEPS program	Yes
<b><i>Utility Assistance Payments</i></b>	Yes	Yes
<b><i>Multiple Service Locations</i></b>	4 County	Single service location
<b><i>Customized Job Fairs</i></b>	Yes	Yes
<b><i>Training Offerings</i></b>	More than 100	Less than 30

*Outside Agency Funding and the Metropolitan Education Commission*

The Outside Agency process is a mechanism by which the Pima County Board of Supervisors supports community-based organizations doing critical work in our community that is not otherwise funded. The process is guided by the Outside Agency Citizen Review Committee made up of six members appointed by each of the Supervisors and one by the County Administrator. This group reviews funding proposals from community entities, makes funding recommendations to the Board and reviews performance reports and receives presentations from the funded entity.

The Outside Agency Program is administered by the Community & Workforce Development Department. Programs are funded in six categories: Community Services; Youth, Young Adult & Family Support; Emergency Food & Clothing; Senior Support, Shelter & Domestic Violence Services, and General Services. An “Other” category contains contracts with community

entities that are funded by other County departments. Awards in the first five categories are competitively reviewed and recommendations for funding are made by the OA Committee, which makes biannual funding commitments.

Awards in the General Services categories reflect historic actions and direction of the Pima County Board of Supervisors that effectively earmark funding to reflect its priorities. In this case the role of the OA Committee is to review the funded entity’s reporting as part of the contract performance evaluation.

**Outside Agencies Programs: General Services and Other Categories**

Organization	Program Name
<b>General</b>	
Arizona-Sonora Desert Museum	Buffelgrass Education and Coordination
ABOR/University of Arizona	Mobile Health Program for Medically Underserved Residents
El Rio Santa Cruz Neighborhood Health Center	Patient Centered Medical Home
El Rio Santa Cruz Neighborhood Health Center	Trichlorethylene Program
Friends of Robles Ranch	Community Foodbank & My Friends Closet
Metropolitan Education	MEC/Regional College Access Center
Pima Council on Aging	Family Caregiver Support/ Home Delivered Meals/ Neighbors Care Alliance/ Rights & Benefits/ Senior Companion
Pima County Community Land Trust	Housing Counseling
Southern Arizona Children’s Advocacy Center	Support Services for Child Victims
United Way of Tucson & Southern Arizona	Volunteer Income Tax Assistance Program
<b>Other</b>	
Desert Survivors	River Park Maintenance
Pima Association of Governments	Overall Work Program



The Honorable Chair and Members, Pima County Board of Supervisors  
Re: **Additional Information for the April 16, 2024 Board of Supervisors Meeting – Addendum  
Item 10, Duplication of Pima County Programs and/or Services**  
April 12, 2024  
Page 9

At its July 5, 2022, meeting, the Metropolitan Education Commission was funded as part of the Board of Supervisors Outside Agency funding approval process. During that discussion the non-competitive nature of funding for this organization was noted by Supervisors, and direction (2:33:52) was provided to move it out of the Outside Agency process. The current contract resides in the Pima County Economic Development Department. The offerings and services by MEC are not otherwise duplicated by any Pima County department.

JKL/anc

c: Carmine DeBonis, Jr., Deputy County Administrator  
Francisco Garcia, MD, MPH, Deputy County Administrator & Chief Medical Officer  
Steve Holmes, Deputy County Administrator  
Diane Frisch, Director, Attractions and Tourism  
Dan Sullivan, Director, Community and Workforce Development  
Heath Vescovi-Chiordi, Director, Economic Development Department